3 Minnette de Silva: the 'Forgotten Pioneer' of Critical Regionalism in Postcolonial South Asia

I first came across Minnette de Silva (1918–1998) in the course of my reading and learning about critical regionalism in Indian post-colonial housing architecture. As mentioned in the introduction, this concept is currently associated with the names of Kenneth Frampton, Alexander Tzonis as well as Liane Lefaivre, and in the Indian context particularly with famous (male) architects such as Charles Correa, B. V. Doshi or Raj Rewal. However, an extension of the geographical lens points to a much earlier contribution of this mobile actor from Kandy in Sri Lanka to the conceptual pre-history and architectural practice of critical regionalism in South Asia. ¹⁹ It is precisely in this context that Liane Lefaivre and Alexander

Another major inspiration for Minnette de Silva (and her parents) which is mentioned in other articles, was the art historian and philosopher Ananda Kentish Muthu Coomaraswamy (1877–1947) who, among other things, stressed the importance of preserving local arts and crafts in Sri Lanka. See, for instance, Florian Heilmeyer (2022). "Spotlight on Women Architects – Minnette de Silva". *Stylepark*, Sep 26. Online available at https://www.stylepark.

¹⁹ As Da Hyung Jeong mentions in the publication for the exhibition on the *Architectures of Decoloniziation in South Asia, 1947–1985* at MoMA in New York in 2022, Minnette de Silva was, among others, inspired by architectural writer James Maude Richards who presented his ideas at the 6th International Conference of Modern Architecture in Bridgewater (CIAM) in 1947 (Minnette Silva was the only woman architect from Asia who participated in CIAM 6): "Decades before Kenneth Frampton's discussion of 'critical regionalism', the critic J. M. Richards took a similar line at the conference, and aspects of (Minnette de Silva's 1953 article, published in the Bombay-based magazine *MARG*) 'A House at Kandy' reveal a keen interest in Richard's ideas. Richards insisted on the existence of specific 'conditions of climate and social custom...in particular localities' and recommended the use of 'local materials' and the incorporation of 'traditional forms'" (Da Hyung Jeong. 2022. "A House at Kandy, Ceylon". *The Project of Independence: Architectures of Decolonization in South Asia, 1947–1985*. Ed. by Martino Stierli, Anoma Pieris and Sean Anderson. The Museum of Modern Art, New York. 178).

Tzonis have also introduced Minnette de Silva in their publications, writing about her, for example, in their book *Tropical Architecture in the Age of Globalization* (co-edited with Bruno Stagno) in 2001:

Da Silva returned to Sri Lanka from the Architectural Association in London where she had studied architecture in 1949. She had started her architecture career working for one of the three persons who would become the most important tropical architects of the post-war period, Otto Koenigsberger, and she remained on intimate terms with the two others, Jane Drew and Maxwell Fry. Yet she broke with their approach (...). For her, practice in Sri Lanka was necessarily linked to broader questions of regionalism and national identity. This is hardly surprising. Da Silva's father was a leading figure in the anticolonial movement of the then Ceylon and in the post-colonial government which gained independence in 1948. Her mother, an early Ceylonese suffragette, campaigned actively for the preservation of the traditional Sinhalese arts and crafts. And her sister, Anil, founded the most important Bombay-based, post-colonial Indian cultural magazine *Marg*. As early as 1950, da Silva was conscious of her highly original position. She coined a phrase to describe it: 'modern regional architecture in the tropics' (Lefaivre & Tzonis 2001: 30 f.).

The two authors also quote Minnette de Silva from one of her own texts, about which de Silva states in her posthumously published autobiography *The life and work of an Asian woman architect* (De Silva 1998) that she had written it in 1950, though she does not cite a source for it:

Ceylon, like much of the East, emerged after the second world war from a feudal-cum-Victorian past and was exposed to new technological influences from the West. A veneer of modernism was acquired at second hand, ill-digested and bearing no relationship to Ceylon's traditions or to the region. No attempt was made to synthesize the modern and the traditional. It is essential for us to absorb what we absolutely need from the modern West, and to learn to keep the best of our traditional forms. We have to think *understandingly* in order to develop an indigenous contemporary architecture, and not to lose the best of the old that has meaning and value (De Silva 1998: 116).

com/en/news/minnette-de-silva-spotlight-on-women-architects-architecture-stylepark (last access Jan 3, 2024).

However, in Deepthie Perera and Raffaele Pernice's view, Minnette de Silva's approach to architecture in Sri Lanka displayed Otto Koenigsberger's "thinking of being responsive to local climatic, economic and social needs" (Perera & Pernice 2022. 'Modernism in Sri Lanka: a comparative study of outdoor transitional spaces in selected traditional and modernist houses in the early post-independence period (1948–1970).' *Journal of Asian Architecture and Building Engineering*, p. 5.).

Here, Minnette de Silva sums up important principles of a modern or critical regionalism in post-colonial architecture, which at the beginning focused in particular on the question of a national identity and expression of cultural difference vis-à-vis the former colonial powers. Accordingly, she sees the post-colonial societal role of architects and a primary task in undertaking a fundamental review and reorientation of their imagination and ideas in relation to architecture as well as urban planning. In her view, the goal must be an architecture that enriches the lives of all and includes all aspects of creative expression, or in short, "the art of living beautifully and joyously" (ibid.).

Fittingly, the following description from 2019 can be found about Minnette de Silva (1918–1998) on the homepage of the *Architectural Review*:

Expressive, unapologetic, and ahead of her time in ecological and participative design, the Sri Lankan architect is considered a pioneer of what she called Modern Regionalism – later to be known as Critical Regionalism.²⁰

The wording and the essay itself is noteworthy, as it was written by Shiromi Pinto, author of a novel based on the 'true life story of Minnette de Silva' entitled *Plastic Emotions* (2019).

When architectural historian Anooradha Iyer Siddiqi pointed out in her important academic article "Crafting the archive: Minnette De Silva, Architecture, and History" (Siddiqi 2017) that there is still no monograph²¹ on this exceptional Sri Lankan architect, she probably did not have in mind a fictional novel to be published two years later. Shiromi Pinto's novel, however, leaves the reader in uncertainty throughout as to which passages, characters, and relationships are actually based on 'historical facts' and what is solely the author's fantasy.

Minnette de Silva's own autobiography, on the other hand, is very difficult to obtain, as it has not been reprinted since 1998. I had the great fortune that Maria Framke agreed without hesitation to photograph page after page of this book for me with her cell phone during an archive stay in London, thus giving me access to it.

As with cinematic biopics, which can gain far more visibility than scholarly research or journalistic investigation, an initial question might be what contribution a fictionalized biography such as Shiromi Pinto's novel *Plastic Emotions* can

²⁰ See https://www.architectural-review.com/author/shiromi-pinto (last access Jan 3, 2024).

²¹ According to Siddiqi's website at Barnard College, Columbia University, she is currently working on such a scholarly book entitled *Minnette de Silva and a Modern Architecture of the Past* or may in the meantime have nearly completed it.

make to the archive and memory of a 'forgotten pioneer' or 'architect forgotten by history', as exactly this has been a primary motivation of the author. Precisely because historical novels can be very well researched and written, the point here is not so much to deny or question in principle that they can make such a contribution, quite the contrary. However, as I would like to illustrate with the example of the two published books about Minnette de Silva – her hard-to-access autobiography, and the already widely circulating fictional novel about her – there clearly exists a mismatch between readers who 'already know' and who can verify what is fact and what is fiction in Pinto's novel and those who hear about de Silva for the first time through the book or the lengthy reviews about it.

On the one hand, Pinto only hints at many real people and encounters from Minnette de Silva's life (as well as from Le Corbusier's biography), so that their classification basically requires quite a lot of prior knowledge. On the other hand, many acquaintances and friends are added who did not exist, while the names or life dates of close relatives have been changed very freely. Hence, readers who do not already know Minnette de Silva's biography that well may not become aware of this at all. Only at the end of her novel does Shiromi Pinto mention in her succinct "Author's note" that

(t)his is a work of fiction. (...) I have taken many liberties with the facts....I have introduced numerous anachronisms...In real life, Minnette's father died before her mother, and neither passed in the manner I've imagined. There are plenty more examples of these disparities throughout the novel. An assiduous reader might have fun uncovering them (Pinto 2019: 421 f.).

However, as some indignant reactions to the freedom Pinto takes to fictionalize Minnette de Silva according to her own wishes and ideas suggest, especially readers who still knew her personally or are currently making a serious effort to inscribe her in the archives of knowledge in which she has long occupied a marginal role, cannot relate to this kind of 'fun'. Nevertheless, in addition to critical reactions,²² there are also several positive reviews that recognize precisely in this unprecedented visibility the achievement of the novel, or at least emphasize that it invites further study of de Silva.²³

²² See for instance Priyanka Lindgren's critical review titled "Resurrecting a forgotten architect. Does the fictionalised retelling of Minnette de Silva's story do justice to her life and work?" (*Himal South Asian*, Oct 7, 2019), available online at https://www.himalmag.com/resurrecting-a-forgotten-architect/ (last access Jan 3, 2024).

²³ See for instance Shahidha Bari's positive review titled "Plastic Emotions by Shiromi Pinto review – an architectural romance". *The Guardian*, Jul 20, 2019. Online available at

Shiromi Pinto's novel *Plastic Emotions* covers a period of more than fifteen years (1949–1965) and presents the (supposed) romantic relationship between de Silva and Swiss-born architect Le Corbusier on the basis of a few described encounters and numerous letters written by the two in diary form, as if it had been central and formative for both their lives.

3.1 Post-Pinto Perception of a Photo?

They are mid-conversation: he is talking, smart hat perched on his head, a coat casually slung on his arm, while she clutches papers close to her chest, the tail of her sari wound over her hair in the traditional way. She gazes at him intently. Looking at the photograph, it seems unsurprising that this real-life encounter and the exchange of letters that followed should have provided Pinto with the bones of her story (Bari 2019).²⁴

This is how Shahidha Bari describes a photograph showing De Silva and Le Corbusier at the 1947 Congrès Internationaux d'Architecture Moderne (photographer unknown, dated 1947). A friendship between the two is assured, as is the great respect that Minnette de Silva felt for the much older world-famous architect. An affair could also be possible, but who would care about such personal matters – and why should it be hyped up to such a formative relationship that it could even, as Pinto's novel seems to suggest, explain de Silva's not being married and her childlessness?

She never married, had no children. The student thinks of her, drawing up plans while dreaming of the man she loved. 'Le Corbusier was a tall man,' the architect has once said. And as she takes a last look inside the house, the student glimpses a younger architect, designing, building, creating – holding her lover behind her eyes until the very end of her days (Pinto 2019: 15).

As is well known, there always needs to be some concrete 'reason' or 'misfortune' in the biography of a woman that comprehensibly, and also in an acceptable way, justifies why she eludes her 'natural' destiny as a wife and mother, doesn't it?

https://www.theguardian.com/books/2019/jul/20/plastic-emotions-by-shiromi-pinto-review (last access Jan 3, 2024).

²⁴ Another interesting photograph showing an exuberant Le Corbusier and amused Minnette de Silva can be found at https://www.ciam6.co.uk/project/on-this-day-in-history-friday-12th-september-1947-ciam6-comes-to-bridgwater/ (last access Jan 3, 2024).

This ironic remark brings me to the question that actually concerns me here: What role do gendered perceptions and representations play in the scholarly, literary as well as journalistic examination of Minnette de Silva's (as well as other 'female pioneers') life and work which has been gaining momentum for some years now, and consequently, for the knowledge archive based on it? It is interesting to note in this context that Tariq Jazeel not only critically observes a deeply gendered "public speculation" about the emotional and personal life of the architect, but also in general the fact that "de Silva's considerable and foundational influence and genius is often refracted through the male figures that in reality her work inspired," as he mentioned in his online presentation at the Womxn in Design and Architecture Conference on Minnette de Silva in 2021. Effect Pazeel refers specifically to the much better-known Sri Lankan architect Geoffrey Bawa.

3.2 A 'Difficult Woman' ...?

Much has been written about the extent to which de Silva's conceptual reflections and practical implementation of a modern regionalism influenced Bawa, not least mediated through their mutual acquaintance Ulrik Plesner, a Danish architect. In Plesner's autobiography entitled *In Situ – An Architectural Memoir From Sri Lanka* (Aristo Publishing, 2012), the author does not leave a good hair on Minnette de Silva's head and at the same time diminishes her importance as an architect. This may have contributed to her reputation as a 'difficult woman', which Pinto also likes to pick up on in her novel and – even worse – allows her fictional "Corbu" to articulate in the very same words.

David Robson, architect and author of many architecture books, cannot find anything to like about either Pinto's novel or Plesner's autobiography, calling the latter "spiteful":

²⁵ The recorded presentation can be viewed at https://vimeo.com/577285337 (last accessed Sep 23, 2023).

²⁶ A rather interesting perspective on this is also given in the short entry on Minnette de Silva to the database of the American Institute for Sri Lankan Studies: "While Geoffrey Bawa (next section) has been heaped with praise for his 'critical regionalist' incorporation of internal courtyards, verandahs, and iconic roofs, Minnette de Silva was the originator of these ideas, even calling herself a regional modernist. And while Bawa's politics were unvocalized and ambiguous, de Silva – like her parents before her – was candidly outspoken in her views, and threw herself into the project of a search for a national cultural expression." See https://www.aisls.org/teaching-about-sri-lankan-architecture/minnette-de-silva/ (last access Jan 3, 2024).

Plesner apparently viewed his sojourn in Ceylon and his collaborations with de Silva and Bawa as the high point of his career and, half a century later, he wrote about it in a fantastical, semi-fictional autobiography in which he sought to inflate his own role at the expense of his two employers and erstwhile friends. His spiteful book catalogues his various sexual exploits including his alleged seduction by Minnette, though he goes out of his way to disguise the nature of his relationship with Bawa. He also seeks to belittle Minnette's architectural achievements and subjects her to cruel character assassination, demonstrating the sort of prejudice that she faced as a woman architect in the 1950s (Robson 2020).

The short preface to Plesner's linguistically unambitious autobiography may suffice to be convinced that Robson's criticism is fully justified, as Plesner mentions his own name first and erases Minnette de Silva's significant contribution to a modern regional architectural style in post-colonial Sri Lanka:

In Situ. An Architectural Memoir from Sri Lanka. How Ulrik Plesner and Geoffrey Bawa, with a spirited group of architects, artists, and craftsmen, created a new architecture for Sri Lanka based on a fruitful fusion of Western, colonial, and local building traditions (Plesner, *In Situ*, 2012).

Ulrik Plesner's autobiography is another book that many people obviously know exists, but which is also not very often available in libraries and therefore not really accessible. However, when the book is mentioned in connection with Minnette de Silva, one sometimes gets the impression that Plesner is talking about her to a great extent. Therefore, it should at least be mentioned here that the third chapter in his autobiography, which is simply titled "Minette" (her name is only written with one 'n' in this book), is actually only 15 pages long (pp. 54–69, while the book itself has 441 pages), and the text is even interrupted by several full-page illustrations. However, the few text pages of this chapter are indeed full of a form of misogynistic nastiness that is not worth quoting or discussing further.

Notwithstanding his critique of Pinto's and Plesner's books, even David Robson considers it important enough to confirm, in light of his personal acquaintance and experience with Minnette de Silva, that she was indeed a "difficult person":

It is true that Minnette was a difficult person who didn't suffer fools, but she was bright, charismatic, brave: an iconoclast who thought 'outside the box' and continually generated new ideas (ibid.).

²⁷ Since I did not want to buy it myself, my only option from Berlin, for example, was to order the book via interlibrary loan from the university library in Cottbus. It does not seem to be available at any other publicly accessible academic library in the states of Berlin and Brandenburg.

3.3 ... or a Feminist and Secular Icon?

Another remark in Robson's angry review of Pinto's novel seems to me no less interesting regarding the question of gendered perceptions and representations:

There has been a recent flurry of interest in Minnette, largely from women academics who seek to laud her as a feminist icon. Whilst this is to be welcomed, it should not be forgotten that Minnette saw herself essentially as a pioneering architect and not as a champion of women's rights (ibid.).

The choice of words here is just as remarkable as the somewhat limited understanding of the relevance of feminist history, which (fortunately) is by no means carried out exclusively by "women academics". Nevertheless, it is an interesting question to what extent not only the gendered perceptions and representations of Minnette de Silva 'as a woman', in word and image, should be critically examined, but perhaps also the recognizable desire of some knowledge actors to unreservedly celebrate their just discovered 'heroine' and, quite deliberately, not to view her too critically. 29

Although it is hardly mentioned in the many reviews, Shiromi Pinto attaches extraordinary importance to presenting de Silva as an undoubtedly secular actor who in no way even remotely sympathizes with the Sinhala-Buddhist majority nationalism that becomes a determining political-ideological force in the 1950s. Herein can be seen the essential 'function' of the two artist-friends invented by Pinto for her novel, Siri and Laki (i.e. Sri Lanka), for Siri's increasing radicalization not only destroys his relationship with Laki but also leads to a break with Minnette, who despises his stance in the novel. If it is the case that a – rather loose – inspiration for the character of Siri was de Silva's famous painter friend

²⁸ The discussion about the question whether feminism and feminist attitudes can be separated from political commitment or rights-oriented approaches is currently ongoing (for instance, with regard to so-called 'lifestyle' or 'corporate feminisms'). It may never reach a final conclusion, precisely as it has to be debated and negotiated anew for each epoch, context and social situation. Nevertheless, the struggle against oppressive systems is always about much more than rights or the question of legal equality, and feminist thought and action is not limited to this alone. Especially since equal access and opportunities for all do not automatically follow from equal rights. Furthermore, feminist research is not least about rethinking possible alternatives and ideas, which can be introduced into broader societal debates.

²⁹ For example, the podcast episode produced about her in the series *She Builds* (episode 17, 2022) conveys this impression, even though it certainly provides an interesting approach to Minnette de Silva (available online at https://www.shebuildspodcast.com/episodes/minnettedesilva, last access Jan 3, 2024).

George Keyt, then the production of unambiguity endeavored here prevents precisely the differentiating consideration of what Tariq Jazeel in his article "Tropical Modernism/Environmental Nationalism: The Politics of Built Space in Postcolonial Sri Lanka" (Jazeel 2017) names and critically examines as ambivalence. Without question, he also seeks to add to de Silva's late appreciation and recognition of her outstanding achievement as a Sri Lankan architect. Nevertheless, Jazeel problematizes in his article that de Silva's growing up in Sinhala Buddhist Kandy in Sri Lanka contributed to the fact that in her "particular mobilization of tradition and history" as an architect working there, she also identified Kandy as the cultural center of a postcolonial national identity grounded in its precolonial heritage (Jazeel 2017: 146). Decidedly, Jazeel does *not* want to portray de Silva as a "Sinhala Buddhist chauvinist" with his critical view (ibid.: 136), but with regard to the "Sinhala Buddhist striations of de Silva's new Ceylonese tropical modernity" he pointedly asks the question:

What space is made available for post-independent Ceylon's non-Sinhala Buddhist others? Tamils, Muslims, and Burghers³⁰, for example (ibid.: 148)?

However, to complicate Jazeel's question, a reference to the Watapuluwa Housing Scheme near Kandy in the 1950s may seem useful, precisely as it is considered a pioneering approach to peaceful coexistence and successfully living together in diverse communities. On this, Chanaka Talpahewa writes:

The building society itself had varied and a mixed set of members. Although being Public Servants, the membership consisted of those hailing from different professions, grades and levels, ethnic groups, religions, social strata and political and ideological affiliations. As a result, Minnette faced the challenge of housing a varied group of individuals (households) within the same development while minimizing the costs. The planning was done adhering to the stipulated rules, standards, regulations, controls and laws (Talpahewa 2020).

Among the notable innovations that set Minnette de Silva's approach to planning this housing project apart from those previously used in Sri Lanka is her inclusion of the wants, needs, and daily practices of future residents. By means of questionnaires, she sought to gain information on this, as well as on the income situation and socio-economic status of the families. On this basis, she developed different types of houses and community amenities to facilitate successful community life. In the course of Minnette de Silva's recent 'rediscovery', the Watapuluwa Housing

³⁰ Minnette de Silva's mother, Agnes (née Nell), who actively campaigned for universal suffrage in Sri Lanka, came from a Christian Burgher family with Dutch roots.

Scheme has also received more interest and recognition as an outstanding social housing project that actually worked, unlike many other approaches of low-cost housing planned top-down and ignorant of the needs of the residents.

In her novel *Plastic Emotions*, Shiromi Pinto has Minnette de Silva speak about this project in a letter to Le Corbusier in the following words:

Finally, Corbu, I'm working on a social housing scheme! I have been wanting this for years – and now it's here. I have 200 units to design and build. It's a huge challenge: so many different people – different religions, ethnicities.

How can one build for all those variables? You must have had similar challenges in Chandigarh – greater ones, in fact. For me, the answer is to start with a series of questionnaires. It seems to me that rather than force a person to live a certain way, we should listen to their needs and try to serve those needs, all the while introducing small innovations that coax the individual towards a more harmonious way of living. I'm sure you agree (Pinto 2019: 318 f.).

In view of the fact that the majority of Minnette de Silva's buildings no longer exist, authors of academic works as well as writers of novels and journalists inevitably have to stick closely to de Silva's autobiography (or on sources based on it). The Life and Work of an Asian Woman Architect (1998) contains numerous letters, newspaper clippings, photographs, and drawings - in addition to her own text passages -, and therefore functions as an essential primary source and material artefact. In addition to her own brief description on the Watapuluwa Housing Scheme, her autobiography also includes letters, a newspaper article, a photo of the general view of the housing scheme as well as the questionnaire she used for this project (De Silva 1998: 207 f.). This, of course, also raises pertinent questions regarding an emerging knowledge archive that can no longer rely on surviving buildings, but primarily on descriptions and illustrations of them. In the framework of the online WDA (Womxn in Design and Architecture) Conference 2021 which was dedicated to Minnette de Silva, some of the speakers expressed that her portfolio had not been very extensive, and that overall, she had also pursued (too?) many different interests. By what standard or norm is the size of this portfolio measured, I wondered as I listened, and isn't it precisely our job as academics to challenge this 'perceived norm'? Doesn't the fact also deserve attention and appreciation that Minnette de Silva saw herself as an architectural historian as well as an educator, and that she practiced both, notably during her time as a lecturer in architectural history at the University of Hong Kong in the second half of the 1970s - not to mention her deep interest in arts, textiles and handicrafts?

As a recently published call for papers for a workshop on "Mobile Actors in Global History" rightly mentions,

(s)tudying mobile actors has given scholars a new understanding of connectivities across national and regional borders and tools to challenge commonly

accepted demarcation lines and, all in all, explore new and exciting horizons in our craft. 31

Even during periods of her life in which she couldn't travel a lot, Minnette de Silva surely was a highly mobile actor, especially if our understanding of (invariably gendered) forms of im/mobility is not restricted to physical or geographical mobility alone, but also includes aspects of emotional, imaginative or media-communicative mobility, as well as (up-/downward) social mobility, among others. Moreover, beyond transregional connectivities and international networks, in Minnette de Silva's case it also seems relevant to understand her many travels, especially between 1959–69, as an integral element of her architectural research practice.

As Anooradha Iyer Siddiqi describes in her insightful article:

During that period, she travelled widely (which later penury prevented). Her passport, stamped from 1959 to 1969 for India, Greece, France, Syria, Cambodia, Thailand, Pakistan, Iran and the United Kingdom (...). This travel-based research led to her writing chapters for the eighteenth edition of Sir Banister Fletcher's A History of Architecture (published in 1975), on the architecture of Ceylon, Afghanistan, Nepal, Tibet, Burma, Cambodia, Thailand, Indonesia, China and Japan (Siddiqi 2017: 1321).

De Silva also collected nearly two thousand slides of cities and heritage sites that she saw as important pedagogical tools for use in lectures (ibid.).

The point of reflecting on the role of gendered perceptions and representations of 'forgotten pioneers' like Minnette de Silva is the consideration that it has become a matter of course for researchers using ethnographic methods to reflect on the situatedness of their own perspective as well as on the multiple positionalities interacting with each other in interview situations or participant observations, and to make these reflections transparent in the writings based on them. A similarly self-reflexive observation would certainly have to take place when we trace an actor in and through a wide variety of sources, collections and archives – only in this way can we also gain insights into a possibly *un*conscious gender bias that may nevertheless have a significant impact on what we research and how we shape and describe the knowledge that we convey publicly.

³¹ Online available at https://www.infoclio.ch/sites/default/files/eventdocs/call.pdf (last access Jan 3, 2024).