Despite these strengths, the volume does suffer from certain limitations that it fails to address. Its abrupt end, without a concluding chapter or epilogue, leaves the reader wondering if this edited volume can be read as a complete monograph or whether each chapter or section serves as a standalone resource. Second, the book's engagement with emotions appears to be limited. To frame emotions as factors contributing to vulnerability in its various forms, the authors contributing to this volume view emotions from the positions of strength/privilege or weakness, or in other words, as individual emotions. The opportunity seems to have been missed to explore the emotional dynamics of the research contexts and how they expose researchers to vulnerability. Third, the book primarily engages with empirical settings within the Global North. Signposting, if not including, empirical settings from the Global South might have further increased the practical utility and application of this book. Finally, the book covers vulnerability within a range of ethnographic, textual and online methods, but it offers little for those wishing to engage with vulnerability in online research. This is particularly the case beyond two aspects of vulnerability in online research that are covered in chapter two (1) ethical, legal and privacy challenges; and (2) an increased possibility of engaging with sensitive topics

Notwithstanding these limitations, the book is a useful resource for qualitative researchers at various stages of their careers across multiple social science disciplines.

Muhammad Salman Khan

LIZ PRZYBYLSKI, *Hybrid Ethnography: Online, Offline, and In Between*. 224 pages, £34.99. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, 2023. ISBN 978-1-07 19-0967-6 (eBook), https://doi.org/10.4135/9781071909676

While technological developments are advancing at an unprecedented pace, the lines between online and offline have become increasingly blurred. Rapid digitisation, widespread internet usage and emerging social media platforms in recent years require more holistic and innovative approaches on the part of social scientists to grasp the intersections and interactions between online and offline. *Hybrid Ethnography*, a concept and practice combining digital and in-person ethnographic methods, is such a book that attempts to respond this need. Liz Przybylski, an interdisciplinary popular music scholar, offers a methodological guideline to carrying out ethnographic research in overlapping fields. The front cover hints perfectly at the blurring of online and offline boundaries with its illustration of an audience member recording a live concert with a

mobile phone. Using insights from her research on indigenous hip hop culture, Przybylski covers all the necessary phases of hybrid research, from identifying the site to collecting/analysing data and sharing results.

The book consists of ten chapters, including an introduction that presents the concept of hybrid research and a conclusion that urges rapid adaptation to improvements in the field. Throughout the chapters, the author aims to upskill researchers, from experienced to complete beginners, in conducting such research. Przybylski starts the book by emphasising the need for hybrid research in a world where the interaction between physical and digital is a social phenomenon (p. 1). The emergence of hybrid fields has not only shaped meaning making, identity formation and cultural practices but also the role of ethnographers and participants. Ethnographers no longer have the unique privilege of recording, documenting and sharing. One of the essential concepts at the centre of the book is thus *expressive culture* which is a way of integrating aesthetic forms and performances such as dance, music, theatre into communication. Shifting roles can be observed in *expressive culture* research in which actors can be both producers and consumers (p. 5).

In Chapters 2 and 3, Przybylski engages with the highly crucial issues of ethics, positionality and reflexivity. Although there is already a broad range of written ethical guidelines, she draws attention to the importance of thinking ethics in the hybrid field. Due to high-speed technological progress in digital tools, software and platforms, researchers should pay attention to these constant changes more than ever (p. 21). The author recommends that researchers stay in touch with colleagues and with their respective research community, and remain updated about the most recent ethical regulations. Another important issue touched upon by the author is awareness of one's own positionality. This obliges researchers to critically consider the power dynamics in the field (p. 29). The emphasis on power relations in multiple domains and intersectionality along with multifaceted identities is further highlighted in other research phases, such as the sharing of results.

This book not only discusses the necessary steps of research but also invites readers to practice. One of the most distinguishable strengths of this book, in my opinion, is the exercises provided by the author. In Chapter 4 she gives useful tips to facilitate the collection and organisation of data that might be much more complicated in hybrid research rather than in classical research. Working with images, text and HTML files necessitates various skills, such as collecting, organising and managing different forms of data (p. 55). She recommends having a structured plan and archive to make it possible to store and organise different data types collected from different sources (p. 61). In addition to traditional methods of jotting down information, taking notes and coding, digital tools might also have a key role to play in organising and managing data (p. 71), as some researchers in the hybrid field work with vast quantities

of data and participants. The author points out four important characteristics of data collection: "structured", "reliable", "archived" and "anchored" (p. 75).

One of the challenging aspects of hybrid research is working with multiple media and moving back and forth between online and offline. In the digital space, reading body language, sensing emotions and interpreting meaning might be a bit trickier than in a face-to-face interaction. Researchers should anticipate "platform-specific codes" and equip themselves with digital literacy skills (p. 79).

In Chapter 5, the author first illustrates the distinctive aspects of online research, such as "interactivity", "imperfect information" and "changing content" (p. 81), then proposes mapping the key figures, organisations, connections and concepts to make sense of the relationships that are essential for the research (pp. 83–84). Chapter 6 tackles the question of how to deal with photography and recordings, since researchers encounter a diverse range of materials created by participants in *expressive culture* research. This chapter is divided into two parts: while the first part elaborates recording strategies with audio, video and photography, the second part focuses more on examining materials produced by participants in the hybrid field (p. 90). The author also details tools and techniques, from smart phones to professional cameras to the rule of thirds for recording and photography (pp. 91–93). Moreover, she once again points out the ethical dimensions of documenting and archiving (p. 105).

Interviews and surveys are an integral part of numerous research projects – both qualitative and quantitative. Yet, there are pros and cons to conducting interviews and surveys in both digital and physical spaces. In Chapter 7, the author discusses possible advantages offered by the hybrid field. It has the potential to overcome the limitations of space and time by enabling connections through various platforms (p. 109). On the other hand, Przybylski warns researchers to be cautious about the choice of medium and the logistics involved, as well as technical issues such as interruptions to online interviews, video or voice calls when the quality of the connection may be unstable (p. 110). She also mentions how to combine interviews and surveys together with hybrid research. Combining the two methods enables researchers to reach individuals beyond the core members of the community (p. 122). After a long period of hybrid interactions, constant moving back and forth between different mediums and collecting data, it's finally time for the analysis phase. In Chapter 8, the author starts the chapter by presenting a few brief points relevant to the switch from fieldwork to analysis: "reviewing documentation", "newly organized information", "addressing to larger body of information", and "building general findings" (pp. 131–132). She then presents possible ways of integrating the software into the analysis. Creating word clouds and using visuals may help researchers in identifying key concepts, names and themes (pp. 140–141).

Sharing results with academic and non-academic audiences brings different priorities and considerations. In Chapter 9, Przybylski addresses various styles and venues of sharing and publishing the results, from academic journals and monographs to podcasts and online platforms (p. 148). One critical issue that arises is paying attention to participant privacy. As noted throughout the book, this last stage of the research again requires critically engaging with ethical issues. The author concludes the book in Chapter 10 by stressing the importance of remaining up to date in a rapidly changing field (p. 169).

Although the book is designed as a method book on hybrid ethnography, the existing literature on digitisation, online-offline interaction and new media could have been mentioned. I was expecting to read more detailed arguments on the conceptualisation of the term "hybrid". For instance, how does the author locate the concept of *hybrid* in relation to digital ethnography[1], netnography[2] and virtual ethnography[3]? How is hybrid research different from other forms of ethnographic research? Critically engaging with the existing concepts would have enriched the literature and contributed to theoretical debates. Additionally, a separate chapter on digital tools and software would have been beneficial, considering the rising need. Nevertheless, this book is a highly useful step-by-step guideline, with each chapter explaining how to carry out research in the hybrid field. I would strongly recommend *Hybrid Ethnography* for those who are interested in ethnomusicology, media and cinema studies and eager for an in-depth understanding of intersections and interactions between online and offline.

Mehmet Özgün Özkul

1   See L. Hjorth / H. A. Horst / A. Galloway / G. Bell (eds): *The Routledge Companion to Digital Ethnography*. New York: Routledge, 2017, pp. 21-28; S. Pink / H. Horst / T. Lewis / L. Hjorth / J. Postill: *Digital Ethnography: Principles and Practice*. Thousand Oaks: Sage, 2015.
2   See R. V. Kozinets: *Netnography: Redefined*. Thousand Oaks: Sage, 2015.
3   See T. L. Taylor / T. Boellstorff / B. Nardi / C. Pearce: *Ethnography and Virtual Worlds: A Handbook of Method*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2013.